DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 148 663 SO 010 517

AUTHOR Barth, James L.
TITLE The Present and Future of the Three Traditions.
PUB DATE Nov 77
NOTE 10p.; Paper presented at Annual Meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies (Cincinnati, Ohio, November 23-26, 1977)

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 HC-$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Citizenship; *Conceptual Schemes; *Inquiry Training; Models; *Rating Scales; Self Evaluation; *Social Sciences; *Social Studies; Teacher Evaluation; Teaching Methods
IDENTIFIERS Purdue Social Studies Preference Scale

ABSTRACT

The authors present a research instrument to help teachers identify which of the three traditions they favor when teaching social studies. According to the authors, in the social studies there have developed three competing traditions which appear to be conceptually distinct. Each of the traditions prescribes different modes of selecting and organizing content and teaching. These include the social studies as citizenship transmission, as social sciences, or as reflective inquiry. These positions present a conceptual scheme for classifying the social studies. The scale presented here has been designed for two purposes. It helps teachers identify the tradition which they seem to favor so that they can develop a consistent approach to their teaching of social studies. Also, it helps teachers become aware that they may not mean the same things when they talk about inquiry, discipline, or responsibility, because they are defining these words in the context of their own viewpoints. The 45-item scale includes 15 statements on each of the three traditions. Each of the 45 items is keyed to a specific work indicator, i.e., "independence," such that the item identifies how each of the three traditions would interpret and understand the meaning of "independence." Also each of the items is keyed to Bloom's and Krathwohl's cognitive and affective taxonomies. (Author/DRS)

****
* Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished *
* materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort *
* to obtain the best copy available. Nevertheless, items of marginal *
* reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality *
* of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available *
* via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not *
* responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions *
* supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original. *
****

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

James L. Barth

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) AND USERS OF THE ERIC SYSTEM."

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

ED148663

THE PRESENT AND FUTURE OF THE THREE TRADITIONS

by James L. Barth
Purdue University

The best contemporary explanations of the Three Traditions are found in The Nature of the Social Studies and Defining the Social Studies. The Three Traditions approach is no more than one means of interpreting the foundations of the social studies. The social studies movement is replete with twists and turns, stops and starts and appears at times to be a historical and philosophical jumble. The Three Traditions identifies the main roots through which the social studies has evolved. The authors do believe that the field should be concerned with clarifying the confusion about the meaning of social studies. If teachers could identify the Tradition which they seem to favor, then possibly it would be easier for them to develop a consistent approach to their teaching of social studies. Of equal importance, social studies teachers should know that they may not mean the same things when they talk about inquiry, discipline, responsibility, because they are defining these words in the context of their own traditions. In other words, to understand each other we need to know the Tradition our colleagues are "coming from." The present and the future of the Three Traditions approach will depend upon both its usefulness in identifying meaning in the field and its adequacy as a research instrument.

Three Traditions as a Research Instrument

The authors have developed a 45 item scale in which there are 15 items on each of the Three Traditions. Each of the 45 items is keyed to a specific word indicator, i.e., independence, responsibility, loyalty, such that the item identifies how a citizenship transmitter, social science, or reflective inquiry would understand the meaning of independence. Also each of the items is keyed to Bloom's and Krathwohl's cognitive and affective taxonomic levels of thinking. For example, item one under citizenship transmission is keyed to the indicator independence, denoting that the transmitter expects his students to think at a cognitive level of 1.21 (recall of specific information) and affective level of 2.1 (responding, willing to comply).

The authors have been working on describing the 45 items since 1973 and have tested and revised these items at least four times. The scale has been used for two purposes. The first purpose was to help teachers identify the Tradition they most strongly favor, and second the items have been used in methods courses as specific descriptors of the Traditions. The 45 items used in the scale can be found on the following pages. If you are interested in using the scale as a means of identifying one of the Three Traditions or as descriptors of the Traditions, see Chapter V, "Check Yourself Out," The Nature of the Social Studies, Barr, Barth, and Shermis, ETC, Palm Springs, California, 1978. To date two published studies are available that have used the Three Traditions Scale: "Where Have All the Inquirers Gone" and "A Cross-Cultural Study of Teacher Candidates' Preferences for Styles of Learning in Social Studies," both by James L. Barth and William Norris in the Indiana Social Studies Quarterly, Vol. XXIX, No. 2, Autumn, 1976. These studies can also be obtained from ERIC/CHESS Computer Search Service, 855 Broadway, Boulder, Colorado 80302.

SO 010 517

Paper presented at Annual Meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies (Cincinnati, Ohio, November 23-26, 1977)

CITIZENSHIP TRANSMISSION

1.	The goal of social studies should be to help students recognize and accept the fact that their independence is subject to limitations imposed by their social heritage. C 1.2. A 2.1*	INDEPENDENCE
2.	Students should learn the basic obligations and responsibilities of good citizenship from their social studies teachers. C 1.3 A 1.2	RESPONSIBILITY
3.	Students should become loyal to those ideals from our social heritage which have traditionally offered a large measure of personal freedom and economic opportunity. C 1.2. A 2.1	LOYALTY
4.	Although our social system is imperfect, students should become citizens who have the moral courage to defend it as the best yet devised by man. C 3.0 A 2.1	COURAGE
5.	Students should accept the inherent logic of the beliefs, attitudes and values which have molded society. C 1.2. A 2.1	LOGIC
6.	To guarantee the continuation of our prized heritage, it is the teacher's task to clarify for students the traditional beliefs upon which our society was founded. C 2.10 A 1.2	CLARITY
7.	Teachers should use student ideas to illustrate and reinforce the traditional themes and values which support the best elements of our social heritage. C 2.10 A 2.1	USE OF STUDENT IDEAS
8.	Teachers' questioning should focus students' attention on recalling important information and values which are essential for becoming a participating adult member of our society. C 1.2. A 1.2	QUESTIONING
9.	Social studies teachers should organize their classrooms for the task of acquiring basic information and values. C 1.2. A 1.2	TASK ORIENTATION
10.	Social studies teachers should primarily evaluate the ability of students to identify, recall and recognize basic information and values which are considered essential by society. C 1.31 A 1.1	EVALUATION
11.	Students should recognize as sources of authority those text writers and scholars who have selected the most important and enduring values and content for the social studies. C 1.21 A 1.2	SOURCES OF AUTHORITY

*The C and A after each item means cognitive and affective levels of thinking according to Benjamin Bloom, ed., Taxonomy of Educational Objectives, Handbook I: Cognitive Domain (New York: David McKay, 2956), and David Krathwohl, ed., Taxonomy of Educational Objectives, Handbook II: Affective Domain (New York: David McKay, 1956).

12. Students should recognize and accept the principles, generalizations and values which are essential to the continuance of society. C 1.2 A 1.2 — MODE OF KNOWING

13. Students should discipline their behavior to conform with certain basic information and values. C 2.1 A 2.1 — DISCIPLINE

14. Students should recognize that teachers and curriculum developers are best qualified to identify the important problems from our social heritage. C 2.21 A 1.2 — DEFINITION OF A PROBLEM

15. Although perhaps of limited immediate appeal, students should recognize that knowledge of specifics and values which have stood the test of time will be needed in later life. C 1.3 A 1.1 — UTILITY OF CONTENT

SOCIAL SCIENCE

16. POSSIBLE ALTERNATIVE Students who have had the benefit of rigorous in-depth study of problems arising out of the different social science disciplines are more likely to become independent and objective in their analysis of social phenomena. C 4.20 A 4.2 — INDEPENDENCE

17. Students who use social science concepts and the social science method will probably formulate and propose responsible decisions. C 5.20 A 3.1 — RESPONSIBILITY

18. Students should place their loyalty in the objective and analytical processes of the social sciences rather than the imprecise understandings and feelings of the average person. C 5.3 A 4.2 — LOYALTY

19. Students should have the moral courage to defend the methods of social science investigation even when the results obtained run counter to popular opinion. C 5.3 A 4.0 — COURAGE

20. The goal of social studies should be to help students acquire the analytical thinking skills and logic used by social scientists. C 5.0 A 4.2 — LOGIC

21. Teachers should clarify both the generalizations and processes of the social sciences for students who will perceive their importance in the future. C 2.2 A 1.2 — CLARITY

22. Teachers should use student ideas in formulating and conduction studies similar to those done by social scientists. C 5.0 A 3.1 — USE OF STUDENT IDEAS

23. Clarifying relationships of social science concepts should be the focus of questioning strategies employed by social studies teachers. C 4.2 A 4.1 — QUESTIONING

24. The social studies teacher's task is to present the concepts and methodologies of the social science disciplines to students who must then apply these to selected problems. C 3.0 A 2.1 — TASK ORIENTATION

25.	Student progress can best be assesed by how well they apply social science concepts and methodology to problems novel to them. C 3.0 A 4.0	EVALUATION
26.	Students can organize their knowledge about social affairs best by using the research procedures and findings of social science authorities. C 3.0 A 4.0	SOURCES OF AUTHORITY
27.	Students' understanding of the scientific method can best be developed if they are directly involved in the analysis and interpretation of scientific data. C 4.2 A 2.2	MODE OF KNOWING
28.	Social Science concepts and the scientific method should be used to develop disciplined behavior in the social studies. C 3.0 A 2.2	DISCIPLINE
29.	Students should develop skills in solving problems which social science scholars have agreed are appropriate for students to pursue. C 3.0 A 3.1	DEFINITION OF A PROBLEM
30.	By internalizing the concepts and methods of the social sciences, students should be able to develop a disciplined mode of analytical thinking. C 3.0 A 3.1	UTILITY OF CONTENT

REFLECTIVE INQUIRY

31.	Students who regularly engage in reflection on problems of their own choosing should become more independent in their thinking and actions. C 6.1 A 4.2	INDEPENDENCE
32.	Students who understand their values and the consequences of their decisions will be better prepared to formulate responsible solutions to personal and social problems. C 6.2 A 5.0	RESPONSIBILITY
33.	Loyalty should be directed not at a particular set of values or institutions, but to a process which emphasizes reflection upon the student's own needs and interests. C 6.2 A 4.2	LOYALTY
34.	Students should have the moral courage to constantly explore their beliefs, to persevere in their decisions, and to alter their decisions based upon reflective judgment. C 6.0 A 5.0	COURAGE
35.	Students' capacity to become more logical will improve as they sense and identify problems and reflect on the decision-making process inherent in resolving conflicts. C 6.0 A 5.1	LOGIC
36.	Social studies teachers should help students clarify their thinking through reflection about issues which concern them. C 6.2 A 4.2	CLARITY
37.	Social studies teachers should use student ideas to promote discussions about social issues meaningful to students. C 5.1 A 4.0	USE OF STUDENT
38.	The questioning strategies of social studies teachers should be aimed at helping students criticize, test and evaluate their beliefs about social issues. C 6.1 A 5.2	QUESTIONING

39.	The principal task of social studies teachers should be to help students assess personal and social value conflicts. C 6.10 A 5	TASK ORIENTATION
40.	Social studies teachers should primarily evaluate students on their ability to apply problem solving skills, judge alternative courses of action, and make choices. C 6. 1/6 A 5.2	EVALUATION
41.	Sources become authoritative when students and teachers judge them critically in relationship to problems which they sense. C 6 A 5	SOURCES OF AUTHORITY
42.	What and how students know arises from investigating problems derived from their own needs and interests. C 5.3 A 5.2	MODE OF KNOWING
43.	Constantly refining one's skills in making decisions about personal and social problems leads to more disciplined behavior. C 6.0 A 5.0	DISCIPLINE
44.	Legitimate problems can only arise if students sense and perceive conflicts within their own belief and value systems. C 6.0 A 5.2	DEFINITION OF A PROBLEM
45.	The validity and relevance of content in solving student identified problems can best be judged by the students themselves. C 6.0 A 5.0	UTILITY OF CONTENT

The 45 items in this list were designed in 1976 by James Barth, William Norris, and Samuel Shermis, Department of Education, Purdue University. These items have been arranged into a Purdue Social Studies Preference Scale. You have the permission of the authors to use the items and the scale. We merely ask that you inform the authors about how you are using the items and the results from the scale.

PURDUE SOCIAL STUDIES PREFERENCE SCALE

The 45 items in this list were designed in 1976 by James Barth, William Norris, and Samuel Shermis, Department of Education, Purdue University. These items have been arranged into a Purdue Social Studies Preference Scale. You have the permission of the authors to use the items and the scale. We merely ask that you inform the authors about how you are using the items and the results from the scale.

Sample Instructions

The following statements are designed to provide information on how you feel regarding social studies education. You may find yourself agreeing with some statements, disagreeing with others, and being uncertain about still others. Whatever your response, you can be certain that many other people feel the same way you do.

There are no right or wrong answers to these statements. Rather, your response simply indicates how you feel about each statement. Remember, your response to any statement should indicate how you usually feel.

Your response to each statement can range from strongly agree to strongly disagree as follows: 1 = strongly agree (SA); 2 = mostly agree (A); 3 = uncertain; 4 = mostly disagree (D); 5 = strongly disagree (SD). Example:

Strongly Agree	Strongly Disagree	
1 2 3 4 5		1. The principle task of social studies teachers teachers should be to help students assess personal and social value conflicts.

Please use a #2 pencil and mark your response clearly on the accompanying IBM card.

1. The principal task of social studies teachers should be to help students assess personal and social value conflicts.

2. By internalizing the concepts and methods of the social sciences, students should be able to develop a disciplined mode of analytical thinking.

3. Social Science concepts and the scientific method should be used to develop disciplined behavior in the social studies.

4. Although our social system is imperfect, students should become citizens who have the moral courage to defend it as the best yet devised by man.

5. Students should recognize that teachers and curriculum developers are best qualified to identify the important problems from our social heritage.

6. Students can organize their knowledge about social affairs best by using the research procedures and findings of social science authorities.

7. Students should develop skills in solving problems which social science scholars have agreed are appropriate for students to pursue.

8. The validity and relevance of content in solving student identified problems can best be judged by the students themselves.

9. Students who have had the benefit of rigorous in-depth study of problems arising out of the different social science disciplines are more likely to become independent and objective in their analysis of social phenomena.

10. Although perhaps of limited immediate appeal, students should recognize that knowledge of specifics and values which have stood the test of time will be needed in later life.

11. The social studies teacher's task is to present the concepts and methodologies of the social science disciplines to students who must then apply these to selected problems.

12. Teachers should use student ideas to illustrate and reinforce the traditional themes and values which support the best elements of our social heritage.

13. Sources become authoritative when students and teachers judge them critically in relationship to problems which they sense.

14. Students should accept the inherent logic of the beliefs, attitudes and values which have molded society.

15. Students should place their loyalty in the objective and analytical processes of the social sciences rather than the imprecise understandings and feelings of the average person.

16. Social studies teachers should use student ideas to promote discussions about social issues meaningful to students.

17. Students should have the moral courage to constantly explore their beliefs, to persevere in their decisions, and to alter their decisions based upon reflective judgement.

18. Students should have the moral courage to defend the methods of social science investigation even when the results obtained run counter to popular opinion.

19. Social studies teachers should organize their classrooms for the task of acquiring basic information and values.

20. Social studies teachers should primarily evaluate the ability of students to identify, recall and recognize basic information and values which are considered essential by society.

21. Students should recognize and accept the principles, generalizations and values which are essential to the continuance of society.

22. Social studies teachers should primarily evaluate students on their ability to apply problem solving skills, judge alternative courses of action, and make choices.

23. Teachers' questioning should focus students' attention on recalling important information and values which are essential for becoming a participating adult member of our society.

24. Students' capacity to become more logical will improve as they sense and identify problems and reflect on the decision-making process inherent in resolving conflicts.

25. What and how students know arises from investigating problems derived from their own needs and interests.

26. Students who understand their values and the consequences of their decisions will be better prepared to formulate responsible solutions to personal and social problems.

27. Legitimate problems can only arise if students sense and perceive conflicts within their own belief and value systems.

28. Social studies teachers should help students clarify their thinking through reflection about issues which concern them.

29. Students should become loyal to those ideals from our social heritage which have traditionally offered a large measure of personal freedom and economic opportunity.

30. The goal of social studies should be to help students recognize and accept the fact that their independence is subject to limitations imposed by their social heritage.

31. The goal of social studies should be to help students acquire the analytical thinking skills and logic used by social scientists.

32. The questioning strategies of social studies teachers should be aimed at helping students criticize, test and evaluate their beliefs about social issues.

33. To guarantee the continuation of our prized heritage, it is the teacher's task to clarify for students the traditional beliefs upon which our society was founded.

34. Loyalty should be directed not at a particular set of values or institutions, but to a process which emphasizes reflection upon the student's own needs and interests.

35. Constantly refining one's skills in making decisions about personal and social problems leads to more disciplined behavior.

36. Students' understanding of the scientific method can best be developed if they are directly involved in the analysis and interpretation of scientific data.

37. Students should learn the basic obligations and responsibilities of good citizenship from their social studies teachers.

38. Teachers should use student ideas in formulating and conducting studies similar to those done by social scientists.

39. Students should recognize as sources of authority those text writers and scholars who have selected the most important and enduring values and content for the social studies.

40. Students should discipline their behavior to conform with certain basic information and values.

41. Student progress can best be assessed by how well they apply social science concepts and methodology to problems novel to them.

42. Students who regularly engage in reflection on problems of their own choosing should become more independent in their thinking and actions.

43. Clarifying relationships of social science concepts should be the focus of questioning strategies employed by social studies teachers.

44. Students who use social science concepts and the social science method will probably formulate and propose responsible decisions.

45. Teachers should clarify both the generalizations and processes of the social sciences for students who will perceive their importance in the future.